

L-Atti tal-Inkjesta datata 19 ta' Novembru 2019, rigward skont it-Termini ta' Referenza ta' l-Inkjesta Pubblika dwar l-Assassinju ta' Daphne Caruana Galizia.

Seduta miżmuma llum l-Erbgha 2 ta' Settembru 2020, fid-9:30 a.m. fit-Tieni Sular, Awla 20, il-Qorti.

Xhud **James Camenzuli** iben il-mejtin Emanuel u Evelina nee` Bouvet imwieled il-Pieta` u residenti Balzan, bil-Malti u bil-gurament tieghu jghid :

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Sur Camenzuli, tridx nibdew billi ittina daqsxejn informazzjoni generali dwar il-hatriet tieghek. Ahna nafu per eżempju li inti gejt kont Chairman ta' Projects Malta bejn it-30 ta' Gunju 2017 ..

Ix-Xhud :

Iva.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

U rrezenjajt fit-13 ta' Mejju 2020.

Ix-Xhud :

Yes yes.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Imbaghad gejt mahtur Chairman fuq Projects Plus ..

Ix-Xhud :

No. CEO Projects Plus

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

CEO Projects Plus fit-28 ta' Jannar 2019

Ix-Xhud :

Ezatt ezatt. Ezatt iva hekk hu

Imhalled A Lofaro :

U ghadek hekk sal-lum hux hekk?

Ix-Xhud :

Ghadni hekk sal-lum fil-fatt.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Hemm overlap qed nara jien, li kien hemm zmien meta kont ghadek Chairman Projects Malta u CEO Projects Plus

Ix-Xhud :

Iva.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Hemm overlap

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Illum, illum voldieri inti qiegħed CEO Projects Plus

Ix-Xhud :

CEO Projects Plus.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Dik hija l-kariga li għandek illum.

Ix-Xhud :

Ezatt, yes

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Tista' tghidilna xi hatriet ohrajn?

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

X' hatriet ohrajn kellek ..

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Tista' tghidilna ftit ghax ahna ..., id-differenza bejn Projects Plus ..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

.... u Projects Malta

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

...u Projects Malta, jgifieri għaliex kien hemm bzonn dawn iz-zewg organizzazzjonijiet differenti.

Ix-Xhud :

Le, huma zewg kumpaniji differenti fil-fatt.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Imma l-iskop taghhom x' inhu jigifieri?

Ix-Xhud :

Mela Projects Plus hija kumpanija bazikament taħdem fuq proġetti kapitali; u Projects Malta hija kumpanija taħdem fuq public private partnership projects.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Jigifieri l-oħra ma għandha x' taqsam xejn mal-privat..

Ix-Xhud :

No

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Mal-pubbliku biss.

Ix-Xhud :

Projects Plus

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Projects Plus mal-pubbliku biss.

Ix-Xhud :

Governattiva

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

All right.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Issa, qabel din il-hatra kont ukoll CEO tal-Medical Services Foundation .

Ix-Xhud :

Foundation for Medical Services yes; kont CEO, fit-2014 gejt mahtur CEO ta' l-FMS

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Tal-FMS. U..

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ta' l-Energija, Water Services x' kont?

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena Chairman tar-regolatur ta' l-Energija

Imhalled A Lofaro :

U ghadek, ok.

Ix-Xhud :

U ghadni.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

U Malta Recourses Authority, hux hekk? Chairman?

Ix-Xhud :

No, ehe ovvjament ghax qabel kien jisimha Malta Recourses Authority u llum il-gurnata jisimha REWS – Regulator for Energy and Water Services.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

U ghadek qed tokkupa din il-kariga sal-lum.

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Ok. Issa nigu ftit ghal progett ta' l-Electrogas tal-PowerStation. Inti bhala professjoni Injiner hux hekk?

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Injiner. X' tista' tghidilna fuq dan il-progett ghal dak li jirrigwardja l-hatra tieghek bhala Chairman ta' Projects Malta jew Projects Plus, jekk kontx involut fiha.

Ix-Xhud :

Ma kontx involut xejn.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Xejn.

Ix-Xhud :

Not at all.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Jigifieri ma kontx involut ‘il ghaliex ma gietx quddiemek jew ghax ma gietx prezentata ..

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Jew ghax mhux suppost li giet quddiemek?

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

...li mhux suppost giet quddiemek?

Ix-Xhud :

L-ewwel nett jiena meta dhalt hemm qatt ma kienet.. qatt ma..; Electrogas lanqas biss.. jigifieri tissemma fir-rwol ta' Projects Malta jew Plus jigifieri.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Xejn.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Jigifieri mhux suppost li giet quddiemek.

Ix-Xhud :

Le jien qatt ma gie xejn quddiemi ta' ..

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Imma mhux hekk staqsejtek; suppost li giet quddiemek jew le?

Ix-Xhud :

Le ma..

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Jew qabel forsi? Qabel?

Ix-Xhud :

Probabbili qabel din; jigifieri jiena wara dhalt hemmhekk

Imhallef A Lofaro :

...grat qabel..

Ix-Xhud :

Ezatt.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Fthemna; ok.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Pero` sibt xi file li jirrigwardja l-Electrogas?

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Minn ta' qablek.

Ix-Xhud :

Fi zmieni ma sibt xejn.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Le, minn qablek, ghax ikun hemm handovers minn Chairman ghal iehor

Ix-Xhud :

Iva; imma qatt ma rajt xejn.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Qatt ma rajt xejn.

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Issa nigu ghal tal-Vitals; ta' l-isptar tal-Vitals; dika giet quddiemek?

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena quddiemi ..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Jew quddiemek fis-sens ta' Chairman, bhala Chairman tal-Projects Malta jew Projects Plus.

Ix-Xhud :

Ovvjament jien taht Projects Malta; jigifieri x-xoghol li sar min-nies ta' qabli ovvjament jibqa' hemmhekk u ovvja l-files qeghdin hemmhekk jigifieri.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Jigifieri l-files tal-Vitals gew quddiem Projects Malta

Ix-Xhud :

Qeghdin Projects Malta; il-files tal-bid, jigifieri ta' li ghandu x' jaqsam mal-Vitals tal-concession ta' l-isptar

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Kif beda l-progett.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Kif beda l-progett.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

..fil- ...taghkom.

Ix-Xhud :

Ezatt. Jigifieri d-dokumenti li ovvjament kellhom x' jaqsmu mal-concession agreement.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Jigifieri intom sibtu fede e comple voldieri gew dokumenti biss? Kontu parti mid-diskussjoni ghandhiex tinghata din il-koncessjoni?

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena fi zmieni meta dhalt id-decizjoni kienet jigifieri ..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Sibtha lesta.

Ix-Xhud :

Kienet diga` ; jiena bhala Projects Malta qed nghid.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Le. Bhala Projects Malta ma tidholx hux?

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena ..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Ghax mhux qed

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena meta dhalt jien id-decizjoni kienet diga` ittiehdet

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Fil-fatt kien gie xi hadd u tlabnieh li jgib il-file mieghu tal-Vitals u gab il-minuti. Issa ma nafx kif ser ikunu ghandna dawn.

Ix-Xhud :

Ovvjament jiena ma ghadnix Projects Malta

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Issa m' ghadekx. Minn meta? Minn Mejju?

Ix-Xhud :

Minn Mejju.

Imhallee A Lofaro :

Jigifieri tal-Vitals ma gietx quddiemek

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

.....ma ghamilt xejn fiha din, fis-sens ma kontx involut wara ...

Ix-Xhud :

Le jiena..

Chairman Imhallee M Mallia :

Qatt attendejt xi cabinet meeting rigward diskussjoni tal-Vitals?

Ix-Xhud :

Iva; bhala Vitals jiena kont mhux bhala Projects Malta, fl-evalutaion .

Imhallee A Lofaro :

Tispjegalna please?

Ix-Xhud :

Fl-evaluation committee.

Chairman Imhallee M Mallia :

Tghidilna ftit kif kont involut?

Imhallee A Lofaro :

Ghidilna ftit inti.

Ix-Xhud :

Mela jiena bazikament kont ghadni l-FMS bhala CEO u gejt imqabba mill-Office of the Permanent Secretary biex impoggi fuq il-Bord ta' l-evaluation tal-VGH ta' l-isptarijiet. Bazikament..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Il-Permanent Secretary or thePermanent Secretary? Il-Permanent Secretary ta' liema Dipartiment? Liema Dipartiment?

Ix-Xhud :

Energy and Projects

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Energy and Projects li kien jaqa' taht il-Ministru dak iz-zmien?

Ix-Xhud :

Konrad Mizzi.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Iva, kompli.

Ix-Xhud :

Jigifieri bazikament gejt mahtur membru fuq dak il-Bord. Ir-remit taghna kien li nevalwaw il-bids fuq il-concession ta' l-isptarijiet u skont l-RFP li harget Projects Malta, jigifieri bazikament ahna rridu nevalwaw il-bids kollha li jintefghu ghal din il-concession, u wara l-process ta' evalwazzjoni kellna ovgjament nghidu.... niddikjaraw min hu l-preferred bidder mill-bids kollha li intefghu.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

U x' gara?

Imhalled A Lofaro :

X' kien ir-rwol tieghek imbaghad?

Ix-Xhud :

Mela jiena ovgjament jiena kont bhala Chairman tal-Bord, jigifieri bazikament il-bids dahlu f' Projects Malta. Kellna nutar li gie biex jiftah il-bids fil-prezenza tal-membri kollha ta' l-evaluation committee; jigifieri din giet dokumentata biex ovgjament il-bids jigu analizzati jekk humiex complaint administratively min-nutar stess. Fl-istess hin..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

In-nutar min kien?

Ix-Xhud :

Marco Burlo`.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Ok.

Ix-Xhud :

Imbaghad bazikament il-bids ovvjament....., sorry, in-nutar fetah l-iscore sheet li kienet issigillata ghandu biex ahna nkunu nistghu nimxu fuq dik l-iscore sheet, u n-nutar ghamililna rapport li ovvjament gie anness mar-rapport taghna ta' l-evaluation committee. Issa ovvjament dika meta tigi ghal parti amministrattiva fejn jinfethu l-bids kollha. Imbaghad ahna bhala Bord bqajna niltaqghu madwar xi ghaxar darbiet biex ovvjament naghmlu l-evalwazzjoni fuq il-bids li rcivejna.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Ghandi nifhem li kien hemm numru ta' bids hux hekk? Kien hemm numru ta' bids.

Ix-Xhud :

Kien hemm tlieta (3) bids.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Tlieta.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Tlieta. Ir-rapport tan-nutar x' kien jghid fis-succinct?

Ix-Xhud :

Mela r-rapport tan-nutar in a nutshell bazikament kien jghid li.. ovvjament iccekkjana r-requirements li kienu specifiki fl-RFP li kellhom ikunu.. li l-bids kellhom ovvjament jaghtu specifikatament amministrattivi biex ikunu compliant u r-rapport jghid il-fatti li tnejn mill-bids ma kienux compliant mainly ghax il-bid bonds ma kienux hemmhekk; jigifieri kien hemm affarijiet ohra; per ezempju copies ma kien hemmx bizzzejjed; milli niftakar ta' jigifieri! Imma kien hemm hafna affarijiet li ma kienux compliant.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Jigifieri minn tlieta spiccat wahda allura hux hekk?

Ix-Xhud :

U minn tlieta spiccat wahda.

Chairman Imhallel M Mallia :

U min kien dan il-wiehed li kien fadal?

Ix-Xhud :

Il-wiehed li kien fadal kien ta' Vital Global Healthcare

Chairman Imhallel M Mallia :

Ta' Vital Global Healthcare

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Imhallel A Lofaro :

Ta' Vitals.

Imhallel J Said Pullicino :

Dawn il-kondizzjonijiet f' envelopes issigillati li fetah in-nutar dak min ikun ghamilhom dawk? Mid-Dipartiment? Mill-Ministru? Minn fejn?

Ix-Xhud :

F' liema sens?

Imhallel J Said Pullicino :

Dawn, ghedtilna li kien hemm envelope li intom ftahtu, u kien hemm il-conditions jew kien requirements u intom taghmlu tip ta' checklist.

Ix-Xhud :

Iva ehe; dik minn Projects Malta ghaddewha lin-nutar u n-nutar zammha ghandu imma..

Imhallel J Said Pullicino :

Imma kien dokument li ghamlet Projects Malta jew kien dokument li ghamlu xi hadd..

Ix-Xhud :

Ma nafx min ghamlu.

Imhallel J Said Pullicino :

Ma tafx min ghamlu.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Imbaghad qed tghidli li kien fadal wiehed

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Il-Vitals.

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

X' gara mbaghad? Intom x' ghamiltu?

Ix-Xhud :

Imbaghad ovvjament bqajna niltaqghu u ssettjajna r-rwol tal-membri x' ghandu jkun. Jigifieri bdejna billi qrajna l-RFP fid-dettal u rajna ezatt Projects Malta xi trid minna bhala Bord u x' ghandna naghmlu. Jigifieri biex ahna nkunu certi li qabel nibdew il-process inkunu nafu ezatt ir-rwol taghna u x' irridu naghmlu. Bazikament iddecidejna li bhala bid kienet komprehensiva hafna u li kellna niffokaw.. per eżempju zewg membri minn tal-Bord iffokaw fuq l-att finanzjari u ghamlu financial analysis, imma min-naha tekniku u mediku ovvjament l-ebda wiehed minna ma kellu l-expertise fuq l-att mediku u tlabna għall-assistenza, u allokawlna lil Mr Charles Grixti bhala.....

Imhallef A Lofaro :

X' esperjenza kellu s-Sur Grixti?

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Orthopaedic surgeon..

Ix-Xhud :

Jien ma kontx nafu personalment; jigifieri ma nistax nghidlek ezatt.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ok.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Jigifieri mhux ghaziltuh intom.

Ix-Xhud :

Le le le

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Min tahulkom allura?

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Gie assenjat lilkom

Ix-Xhud :

Gie assenjat...; tlabna ghal ghajnuna u assenjaw..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Minn ghand min imma allura?

Ix-Xhud :

..lil Projects Malta.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Lil Projects Malta. Kurjuza din. Ghax lilna l-Projects Malta qalulna li sabu kollox lest u ma ghamlu xejn ta! Ma nafx x' jigifieri, f' daqqa wahda ghamiltu kollox donkom! Ma nafx. Imma ta' qablek hekk qal. Li sabuh lest dan; anyway. Jigifieri kellkom bidder wiehed u kontu qed taraw tevalwaw dak il-bider jekk kellux ... biex jissodisfa...

Ix-Xhud :

Ezatt.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

U due diligence ghamiltu allura?

Ix-Xhud :

Ahna ghamilna financial analysis. Il-bid kif diga` ghedt ..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Li tinkludi due diligence fuq l-investituri?

Ix-Xhud :

Jekk ittini cans bazikament l-RFP tirrikjedi li l-bidders kellhom jissottomettu prova tal-kapacitajiet taghhom fejn tigi teknika, fejn tigi ovvjament teknika u medika, fejn tigi finanzjarja u operat. L-RFP section 4 kienet telabora ezatt ahna x' ghandna nassessjaw fuq il-bids li nircievu. Bazikament il-bid kienet kif ghedt kienet komprehensiva hafna. Il-VGH taw prova solida u konkreta b' ittra ta' comfort letters fil-bid stess tal-finanzjament min ha jaghtihulhom, jigifieri ta' l-att mediku u tekniku u ta' l-operat. Jigifieri huma.. bhala bid kien hemm proof li l-informazzjoni li qed jiddikjaraw hemm black on white min ha jaghmel tajjeb ghalihom, jigifieri kienet prova. U barra minn hekk il-financial experts taghhom kien Price Waterhouse Coopers jigifieri kienet.. il-bid kienet maghmula b' mod professjonali.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Ifhem, hawnhekk ma ahniex biex naraw il-process tal-Vitals; dik hija xi haga li ma ghandhiex x' taqsam m' hawn. Ahna ghal affarijiet ohra... kif taf inti.

Ix-Xhud :

Ehe.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Jigifieri on paper inti qed tghid li kienu regola bhala.. ghalikom

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Kienu regola. Allura jekk wiehed jghid li... almenu l-allegazzjoni hi li ma kellhomx esperjenza fir-running ta' l-isptarijiet dana kien fattur element importanti jew inkella kien hemm xi bilanci ..

Ix-Xhud :

Ara, bazikament VGH huma dahlu ghaliha bhala joint venture; jigifieri VGH, il-kumpanija VGH kella kif ghedt jien affiliation ma diversi kumpaniji. Mela biex nispyega bazikament dan huwa designed and built and operate project. Jigifieri meta nigu ghad-disinn jigifieri huma l-isptarijiet ta' Ghawdex, ta' St Luke's u Karen Grech, dawn kienu qabdu lil HERI li huwa kumpanija ta' Injineria rinomati fl-Istati Uniti li dawn ghamlulhom il-concept design diga`; u kellhom dikjarazzjoni li dawn ser jahdmu fuq id-disinn tal-isptarijiet sabiex ovvjament igubuhom fi stat li huwa dinju u accettat ghal kulhadd.

Imbaghad min-naha finanzjarju kellhom dikjarazzjoni mill-UBO, jigifieri Ultimate Beneficialry Owner huwa Oxley Group. Li ukoll Oxley Group huwa investment company li hija b' sahhitha, li investiet f' hafna progetti ta' sptarijiet barra minn Malta, fl-Istati Uniti. U bazikament kellhom ukoll ittri ta' konferma minn diversi banek. Jigifieri kellhom iddikjaraw li ser igibu seventy percent (70 %) ta' l-investment minn banek, jigifieri kellhom il-Bank of India li ddikjara li ser isellifhom. Kellhom banek ohra bhal l-Alliance u bhal Bank of Singapore wkoll li ddikjaraw li ser iselfuhom l-investment. Barra minn hekk kellhom ukoll syndicate ta' professuri barranin u expertise li wkoll kienu lesti li joffru l-investment tagghom parti biex ovvjament jghaqdu l-investment totali. Dak minn l-att finanzjarju.

Pero` wkoll minn l-att mediku kellhom dikjarazzjonijiet per eżempju minn l-MAMV li huwa... sorry, FANV li hija l-foundation... MANV, sorry, Medical Association of North Virginia. Bazikament dawn huma esperti baranin, huma

rinomati, jigifieri kienu lesti u ddikjaraw li bis-CVs inkludi fil-bid jigifieri ta' kwalunke espert, jekk qed nitkellmu fuq espert tal-qalb; jekk qed nitkellmu fuq espert... fuq trauma jew rehabilitation; kellhom il-backup kollu mediku fil-fatt fil-bid ukoll. Jigifieri dawn kienu l-agreements ghamluhom diga`.

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Jigifieri inti sodisfatt illi l-paperwork u d-dokumentazzjoni ..

Ix-Xhud :

Iva.

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Kienet konficjenti u ..

Ix-Xhud :

Iva.

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Il-problema tnejn, ghaliex, kif tispjega allura li jirrizulta wara li l-main promoter kien persuna mhux biss bla esperjenza imma kien daqsxejn b' background difficili?

Ix-Xhud :

Ifhimni, with hindsight tista' tghid ..

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Imma issir? Dik l-investigazzjoni ma ssirx minn qabel fuq il-persuni? Dik li nghid inti.

Ix-Xhud :

Bazikament kif ghedt; jiena, dhalna fil-bid; inti ghandek VGH u mbaghad ghandek dawn id-dikjarazzjonijiet kollha minn kumpaniji li ovvja huma rinomati; ghanek il-Price Waterhouse li fformalizza il-bid totali. Jigifieri dawn mhux qed..., qed insemmu kumpaniji serji. Jigifieri ahna bazikament analizzajna d-dokumenti ..

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Ma ahniex qed ... lilkom ghax intom timxu ...

Ix-Xhud :

Mhux hekk? Jigifieri..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Pero` l-verita` hi li l-progett b' xi mod jew iehor gralu li gralu anke ghaliex kien hemm involuti telf ta' flus jew finanzi tal-gvern. Jigifieri dan intom ma thossx li mortu daqsxejn ..?

Ix-Xhud :

No. Ghax ahna, jiena, ahna imxejna bir-remit li kien moghti lilna..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Li kellkom, ehe.

Ix-Xhud :

U anzi ghamilnih b' reqqa sincerament kollha jigifieri, qghadna attenti hafna u dak li kien mitlub minna skont kif ghedt fil-kapitlu 4 ta' l-RFP ghamilnih bazikament totali.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Dan l-Oxley Group min kienu? Min huma?

Ix-Xhud :

Oxley Group huma investment company li investew hafna f' progetti barranin, bhal sprajiet, real estates u jigifieri qeghdin.., is-CV tagghom.. mhux is-CV insomma, il-company profile tagghom qieghed fil-bid ukoll.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

U fejn hu registrata din il-kumpanija?

Ix-Xhud :

Ma niftakarx. Offhand..

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Ma tiftakarx.

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

U min huma s-shareholders ghandek idea? Tiftakar xi haga?

Ix-Xhud :

Ifhimni, ma nazzardax ghax ma niftakarx jigifieri min huma ezatt is-shareholders taghha. Ghaddah ftit zmien!

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Forsi tal-Oxley Group ghandek ragun, imma tal-VGH? Kontu tafu tal-VGH min huma?

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Tal-VGH min kienu?

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Ghax tal-Oxley Group tifhimha; kumpanija kbira

Ix-Xhud :

Iva ta' VGH kien hemm ovvjament Ram Tumuluri. U mbaghad kien hemm diversi nies ohra imma ma niftakarx x' jisimhom jigifieri.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Imma jirrizultalkom lilkom jigifieri? Ghandkom min huma dawn.

Ix-Xhud :

Iva qeghdin kollha fil-bid. Fil-bid hemm kollox dettaljat bis-CVs ta' kulhadd, bil- ..

Imhallef A Lofaro :

U iccekjajtuhom dawn intom.

Ix-Xhud :

Iva mela.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Kien hemm kumpaniji baranin ukoll dawn fosthom ...?

Ix-Xhud :

Sorry?

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Kien hemm kumpaniji esteri wkoll?

Ix-Xhud :

Kif ghedt, kien hemm l-Oxley Group ..

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Ehe, imma ..

Ix-Xhud :

Imbaghad kien hemm ..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Bhala shareholders tal-VGH jiena; shareholders tal-VGH. Ghax in-negozju magghom sar basically...

Ix-Xhud :

Iva kien hemm. Ovjament ma niftakarx; ghadda z-zmien jigifieri ma nistax nghidlek ezatt. Pero` hemm kollox inkluz fil-bid.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Sewwa; imbaghad ir-rakkomandazzjoni taghkom x' kienet?

Ix-Xhud :

Le bazikament imbaghad ir-rakkomandazzjoni taghna kienet li skont kif talbet RFP id-dikjarajna li l-preferred bidder ovvjament huwa VGH u l-gvern jista' imur ghan-next step fejn jibda id-diskusjonijiet u n-negozjati mal-VGH.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Kontu parti f' dawn in-negozjati mbaghad?

Ix-Xhud :

No no.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Kien hemm xi rizenji minn Projects Malta?

Ix-Xhud :

Skuzi?

Ix-Xhud :

Kien hemm xi hadd li rrizenja in konnessjoni ma' dan il-progett minn Projects Malta?

Ix-Xhud :

Ma niftakarx.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Ma tiftakarx?

Ix-Xhud :

Ma niftakarx ta.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Voldieri r-remit taghkom waqaf sal-mument li intom ghamiltu r-rakkomandazzjoni.

Ix-Xhud :

We declared the preferred bidders.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

You declared the preferred bidders. Minn hemm 'il quddiem ma kellkom x' taqsmu xejn.

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Xejn xejn.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Xejn.

Ix-Xhud :

Nothing.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ghamiltu xi rapport lill-Ministru Konrad Mizzi?

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Xejn?

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Lanqas evaluation report?

Ix-Xhud :

Li ghamilna evaluation report u ghaddejnih lil Projects Malta

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Dak ghamiltu. Lil Projects Malta.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Lill-Ministeru tal-Finanzi kontu involejtuhom b' xi mod?

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Lanqas.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Kellkom xi reclaim.. xi propesta minn bidders ohrajn – miz-zewg bidders l-ohrajn? It-tnejn accettaw li huma eskluzi?

Ix-Xhud :

No ma kellna l-ebda protesta.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

L-ebda protesta.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Ma sarx appell min-naha tagghom?

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Kemm irrizultalkom li kien ix-share capital ta' din il-kumpanija VGH?

Ix-Xhud :

Il-VGH bhala kumpanija biex irregistrawha kien ma nafx.. xi elf u mitejn talli tirregistra; pero` kellhom lil Oxley Group li kienu qed jaghmlu a direct.. minhabba l-equity ta' disa' miljuni.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

U l-procedura taghkom kienet tinkludi wkoll parir fuq il- f' dan il-progett?

Ix-Xhud :

Skuzi?

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Jekk ir-remit taghkom kienx jinkludi parir fuq il- ..

Ix-Xhud :

Le bazikament min ghamel l-assessment finanzjarju kellu jassessja li dan huwa feasible kif qed tghid inti.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Fil-fehma taghkom kien feasible.

Ix-Xhud :

Iva.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Allura kif falla mbaghad ghal darba darbtejn...?

Ix-Xhud :

Ovvjament..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Ic-cirkostanzi ..

Ix-Xhud :

...ahna qed nghidu sa dak l-istat taghna, jigifieri minn hemm 'l hemm imbaghad...

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Jekk hemm xi domandi..?

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Jekk hemm xi domandi ghalissa fuq dan biss.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ok. Mela biex nikkonferma, inti kont membru ta' l-evaluation committee tal-bids fuq ta' l-isptarijiet le? Ruq l-RFP ta' l-isptarijiet

Ix-Xhud :

..

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Dak l-evaluation committee tista' taghtini meta inhatar u sakemm domtu tahdmu?

Ix-Xhud :

Mela, minghalija... ma niftakarx ezatt, pero` minghalija xi November ta'.... le mhux.; March tal- '15? Minhiex cert. Dati ma niftakarhomx.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ok. Jigifieri March tat-2015 kont parti minn l-evaluation committee

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Imma mbaghad fuq Projects Malta u nhtart fl-2017.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Yes.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Bejn l-2015 u l-2017 kellek relazzjoni ohra ma' Projects Malta? Kellek xoghol iehor ma' Projects Malta?

Ix-Xhud :

Bejn l-elfejn u... iva.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

X' kien dak ix-xoghol?

Ix-Xhud :

Bazikament ...

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Fiex kien jirrigwardja?

Ix-Xhud :

Mhux problema. Kienu qabduni... kien hemm progett iehor ta' MAX Tourism ta' San Gorg u kien irrozenja c-Chairman tan- negotiation committee u kienu appuntaw lili bhala replacement Chairman.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Jiena fhimtek illi dokumentazzjoni fir-rigward tal-Vitals hemm fi Projects Malta jew inti sibt meta dhalt Chairman ta' Projects Malta; imma dokumentazzjoni fir-rigward ta' l-Electrogas ma sibt.

Ix-Xhud :

Le m' hemmx; ma rajtx jigifieri jien.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ok. L-involvement ta' Projects Malta fir-rigward ta' l-RFP ta' l-isptarijiet tista' tispjegalna fiex kien jikkonsisti? Inti dak iz-zmien kont membru ta' l-evaluation committee

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Inti, mil-lant Projects Malta x' kont tircievi? Kont tircievi struzzjonijiet?

Ix-Xhud :

No le. Jiena bazikament terga' kif ghedtlek, l-appointment form giet minn l-office tal-Permanent Secretary u gejt appuntat bhala Chairman ta' l-evaluation committee. Ovvjament L-ewwel darba li dhalna hemmhekk kien hemm kif ghedt in-nutar u bdejna l-process ta'....

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ehe, pero` jekk fhimtek sew inti ghedt ahna wettaqna dak li Projects Malta riedet minna; u ghedt ukoll li l-evaluation reprot tajtuh lil Projects Malta

Ix-Xhud :

Mhux..., jiena l-RFP; request for proposal tghidlek xi trid minnek; mhux Projects Malta. Request for proposal huwa dokument.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ir-request for proposal min tahulek lilek?

Ix-Xhud :

Tahulna Projects Malta biex nibdew l-evaluation.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Ha nghidlek, dawn id-domandi huma intizi biex nipprovaw nirrikonciljaw dak li qed tghid inti ma' dak li qalilna haddiehor

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Jien mhux qed nipprova naqbddek f' xejn. Biex inkun cara

Ix-Xhud :

Le le; pero` sa fejn naf jiena sincerament kien dokument pubbliku ta' jigifieri..

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Ehe, imma li qed tghid donnu li jaghmel sens issa ma dak li smajna qabel illi Projects Malta kienet speci ta' postman biss; ma kinetx involuta verament fil-progett ghaliex ... id-dokument minn ghand xi hadd iehor, taghtu lilek u intom ghamiltu x-xoghol hu. Jista' ikun li dik hija l-ispjega ghaliex min gie hawnhekk u qalilna li ma ahniex imdahhla f' xejn ahna. Ma konniex imdahhlin ghaliex....; ma nafx, ghidilna inti. Tirrikoncilja z-zewg verzjonijiet

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Per ezempju l-komunikazzjoni tieghek bhala Chairman ta' l-evaluation committee ma' Projects Malta ma' min kienet issir?

Ix-Xhud :

Ovvjament konna nkellmu impjegat ta' Projects Malta li huwa John Valenzia meta kellna bzonn xi affarijiet biex bhala assistenza

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Mal-Bord tad-Diretturi..

Ix-Xhud :

No no.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Xejn. Jigifieri r-relazzjoni taghkom bhala evaluation committee ma' Projects Malta kienet tirrigwardja rikjesti ta' ghajnuna ta' assistenza?

Ix-Xhud :

Per ezempju, ezatt.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

U x' izjed?

Ix-Xhud :

Daqshekk; dak kollox.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Per ezempju jew daqshekk?

Ix-Xhud :

Iva le, ghax ghedtli assistenza

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ok. Mela inti semmejt illi kien hemm tliet bids li dahlu

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

U dawk il-bids infethu fl-ufficcju ta' Projects Malta?

Ix-Xhud :

Iva.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Issa, iz-zewg bids l-oħra li kienu dikjarati non-compliant taf ta' min kienu?

Ix-Xhud :

Image Hospitals u BSP Investments.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Image Hospitals u BSP Investments, intom bhala evaluation committee ivverifikajtu min huma?

Ix-Xhud :

Ovvjament kien hemm innizzel fis-submission tagħhom; ma niftakarx l-ismijiet offhand min huma imma jigifieri. Imma hemm innizzel kollox min huma. Meta jagħtu l-bid ikun hemm innizzel l-ismijiet tan-nies li jiffurmaw il-kumpanija etc.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ivverifikajtu jekk kienux fake fronts?

Ix-Xhud :

Fake front?!

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ehe.

Ix-Xhud :

Ahna bazikament ..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Jekk kienux? Dottoressa, ma qbadthiex. Jekk kienux xiex?

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Fake fronts.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Jekk kienux fake fronts

Ix-Xhud :

Fake frant...; ahna ifihimni, ahna r-remit taghna diga` kont ghedtlik; jigifieri ahna ilqajna il-bids u evalwajnihom.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ehe imma x' tip ta' evaluation ghamiltu fil-konfront ta' Image Hospitals u BSP Investments

Ix-Xhud :

Kif ghedtlik; Image Hospitals u BSP infethu quddiem in-nutar u ovvjament dahlu f' kull bid; kull bid dahal in-nuatr fid-dettal u innota li kien hemm affarijiet neqsin.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Affarijiet serji hux hekk? Ghandi nifhem affarijiet serji neqsin; mhux affarijiet...; affarijiet ta' sustanza neqsin, hux hekk?

Ix-Xhud :

Per ezempju bid bond

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Bid bond ma kienx hemm.

Ix-Xhud :

Ma kinetx hemm.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Inti semmejt illi fl-evaluation committee kontu iddecidejtu li taqsmu x-xoghol, u ghedt kien hemm zewg membri li kellhom jiffukaw fuq il-financial analysis..

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Mien kienu dawg iz-zewg membri?

Ix-Xhud :

Robert Borg u Emmanuel Castagna.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

U meta tghid wettqu financial analysis, wettqu financial analyses tal-proposta biex jew ghamlu wkoll financial due diligence tal-persuni tax-shareholders ta' Vitals illi kienu qeghdin jibbidjaw?

Ix-Xhud :

Ghamlu kif ghedt dahlu fid-dettal fil-bid fil-financial declarations li kien hemm immizzlin u naf zgur ukoll li ghamlu biex jaraw ghall-imhalled bhal feasibility iccekkjaw il-gvern ovvjament kemm qed ihallas bhalissa fuq subventions lit-tliet sptarijiet, u kemm ghandu sodod u kemm talab, u irrizulta li ovvjament dawn il-gvern kien at the end of the day during the concession ha johrog prezz irhas u izjed sodod.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Ghal feasibility mad-Dottoressa ghal feasibility

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Imma d-Dottoressa qed tistaqsik jekk fuq il-persuni li huma l-investituri sarx dan id-due diligence

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Financial due diligence.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Jigifieri ghandi nifhem li fil-files taghkom .

Ix-Xhud :

Il-file kif ghedt, kien tant komprehensiv li kien hemm id-dikjarazzjonijiet kollha mit-third parties

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Le le, kollox sew. Imma fuq il-persuni. Ifhimni, normalment jekk ser jigi jinneozja mieghek l-ewwel haga li jistaqsi jghidlek inti min inti? Jew immur niccekkja, nara, jien naf? fuq l-internet, nara dan min hu dan? Qed tifhem? Ghal persuna issa qed nghid. Biex naraw is-serjeta`. Ghax il-progett on paper zgur li kien sabih u ma intikom l-ebda tort li ghaziltuh. Pero` jekk saritx din l-ezami fuq il-persuni li kienu indikat bhal l-investituri. Ghax ahna din importanti hafna hu.

Ix-Xhud :

Iva, imma bazikament kif ghedt jiena. Jigifieri l-persuni kienu jiformaw joint venture; ...

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Mhux importanti ...

Ix-Xhud :

Jigifieri joint venture, jiena ha mmur niccekja fuq Price Waterhouse? Ha mur niccekja fuq Oxley Group?

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ghala? Price Waterhouse kienu parti minn l-investituri?

Ix-Xhud :

Kienu l-financial experts taghom

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Il-financial expert ma huwiex l-investitur. Mela jekk .

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Ok, jiena nista' nifhem, tghidli Price Water House; nafuha, ghax kumpanija qiegħed hawn Malta u nafu x' inhi. Imma Oxley, dina ma nafx; Oxley qatt ma smajtha, qatt ma smajt b' din il-kumpanija jien.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Fil-fatt għandi mistoqsija fuq Oxley.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Jiena naf l-ohrajn, l-ittri ta' rakkomandazzjonijiet illi kien hemm dawn ivverifikajtuhom illi huma genwini? Gejjin minn postijiet rinomati?

Ix-Xhud :

Ifhimni, jekk ikollok dikjarazzjonijiet minn Bank of India, minn Bank of Singapore...

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Bank of India ngħid jien..!

Ix-Xhud :

Jigifieri l-karti hemm kienu fil-bid.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Tezisti din il-Bank of India per eżempju? Jew ghandu xi forma taht xi isem iehor?

Ix-Xhud :

Tezisti hu, jigifieri..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Qed timmagina?

Ix-Xhud :

Le; mhux nimmagina.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Eh?..

Ix-Xhud :

Min ghamel l-att finanzjarju ccekja, jigifieri jaf. Jien minhiex.. jien I am not a financial person..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Jigifieri dawn li ghamlu l-evlwazzjoni finanzjarja dahlu f' dawn il-kwistjonijiet.

Ix-Xhud :

Yes. Icekjaw fid-dettal il-financial bid. Jigifieri ..

Imhallef A Lofaro :

U dan tafu kif jekk joghgbok? Kif tafu dan?

Ix-Xhud :

Ghax ghamlu rapport.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ghax ghamlu r-rapport.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Mela jekk il-bid kienet dokumentata sew b' dawn id-dokumenti, fir-rigward ta' Oxley Group nimmagina li l-bid kienet tghid ukoll min hu l-Ultimate Beneficial Owner ta' dan il-grupp?

Ix-Xhud :

Ta' VGH l-UBO kien Oxley Group.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Le; ta' Oxley Group. U ta' Oxley Group?

Chairman Imhallel M Mallia :

Wara Oxley Group. Min hemm wara Oxley Group?

Ix-Xhud :

Ma niftakarx; ma nafx

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ivverifikajtu jekk kienx hemm xi hadd wara Oxley Group u min il-UBO?

Ix-Xhud :

Ma niftakarx. Jigifieri

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ifhem, meta insaqsik jekk sarx due diligence fuq ix-shareholders u due diligence fuq min qed jaghtihom il-letters of comfort, qed nistaqsik jekk ivverifikajtux jew tafux min hu l-Ultimate Beneficial Owner ta' dawn il-kumpaniji, dawn ghamiltuha dan l-ezercizzju? Kull avukat irid jiccekja minhabba l-FIAU min hu l-UBO tal-klijent tieghu. Il-UBO ta' Oxley Group sibtu minn hu?

Ix-Xhud :

Ara, jien ma nistax..., ma niftakarx, jigifieri forsi wiehed irid jiccekja ma..., imma jien ma niftakarx.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ghad ghandek access ghar-rapport tal-..?

Ix-Xhud :

No m' ghandix m' ghandix.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ghalfejn m' ghandekx?

Ix-Xhud :

Ghax ma ghadnix Projects Malta.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Hawnhekk ma kontx Projects Malta. Hawnhekk inti kont fuq l-evaluation committee mhux Projects Malta

Ix-Xhud :

Ezatt.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Allura l-fatt li ma ghadekx Projects Malta ma jfissirx li ma ghandekx kopja tar-rapport.

Ix-Xhud :

M' ghandix kopja.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Jigifieri inti meta tlaqt, meta spiccajt minn l-evaluation committee ma zammejt kopji tar-rapporti ghalik?

Ix-Xhud :

M' ghandix kopja', m' ghandix kopja.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Il-kopja ta' l-evaluation ..

Ix-Xhud :

By the way, kellna non-disclosure agreement iffirmata minn kull membru wkoll

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ghalhekk qed tghidli li ma ghandekx kopja?

Ix-Xhud :

Jien ma zammejt kopja.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Kopja ta' l-evaluation zammejt? L-evaluation report?

Ix-Xhud :

No nothing.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Imma inti mhux prezentajt l-evaluation report f' Awla ohra?

Ix-Xhud :

Imma ovvjament dak kien mitlub u ..

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Mela ha nerga' insaqsik jekk il-Bord...

Ix-Xhud :

U... u gie minn l-entita`, minn Projects Malta.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Jekk il-Bord jitlobok dawn ir-rapporti inti tista' iggibhom?

Ix-Xhud :

Jien ma nistax ghax ma ghadnix Projects Malta.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

... imma sorry ta', . irridu nkunu serji issa!

Ix-Xhud :

Skuzi?

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Irridu nkunu serji. Jigifieri inti qed tghidli spiccajt minn Projects Malta u qattejt kollox

Ix-Xhud :

Le ma nistax ingibhom jien id-dokumenti tal-kumpanija. Jekk inti tkun tahdem ma' kumpanija u ma ghadekx maghha ..

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Dawn ma humiex dokumenti tal-kumpanija. Inti kont membru fl-evaluation committee.

Ix-Xhud :

Huma tal-kumpanija

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Dak iz-zmien ma kellek l-ebda konnessjoni ma' Projects Malta, support. Hekk kienet?

Ix-Xhud :

Meta kont fl-evaluataion ma kontx Projects Malta.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Allura inti bhala Chairperson ta' l-evaluation committee spiccajt xoghlok u lil min tajthom id-dokumentazjonijiet tieghek?

Ix-Xhud :

Lil Projects Malta.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Hassart l-emails kollha?

Ix-Xhud :

Ma kellix emails.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Allura kif kienu jinghatwlek il-kopji tal-financial report?

Ix-Xhud :

Il-financial report bazikament kien jigi.. ghedtlik kellna xi ghaxar meetings u kien gie sottomess waqt wiehed mill-Board meetings.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Jigifieri ghandi nifhem illi l-financial report inkiteb by hand?

Ix-Xhud :

U le ma nkitibx by hand

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Allura kif kontu tikkomunikaw bejnietkom fuq dawn ir-rapporti?

Ix-Xhud :

Mhux jaghmlu presentation lill-Bord!?! Lill-individwi li qed jaghmlu ir-remit taghhom?!?

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Jien qed inhossha stramba ta! Qed inhossha stramba, ghaliex bhala regola, jekk jien naghmel bicca xoghol anke ghad-difiza tieghi stess, ghas-sodisfazzjon tieghi u li ma jkunx hemm xi hadd li jimmidizerpretani, jien inzomm kopja.

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena ma ghandix kopja Sur Imhalled.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Issa haga bhal din narha stramba illi ma jkollokx kopja! Issa ghandek id-dritt tghid ma ghandix u ma ghandix..

Ix-Xhud :

M'' ghandix

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Imma hija stramba ghalija.

Ix-Xhud :

Sincerament m' ghandix

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Normalment anke jekk jiena mort nikteb setenza inzomm kopja halli ghada pitghada ...

Ix-Xhud :

Sincerament ma ghandix kopja Sur Imhallef.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

M' ghandekx kopja

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ma bsartx li ser insaqsuk fuq hekk illum imma?

Ix-Xhud :

Skuzi?

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ghax ma tantx tidher li ghamilt homework. Ma bsartx li ser nistaqsuk fuq dawn l-affarijiet illum?

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena ma nisatx.. jiena naf li fit-tahrikja hemm li ngib id-dokumenti; ma stajt ingibhom imma, ghax jiena minhiex ..

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Ghandek ragun, u jgibhom min qieghed hemm illum. Igibhom min qieghed ..

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ma tantx qed taghtina informazzjoni inti.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

...inti illi fil-files ta' Projects Malta hemm dan li qed tghid int.

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Hemm.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Inti meta spiccajt minn Chairperson ta' l-evaluation committee lil min ghaddejthom dawn ir-rapporti?

Ix-Xhud :

Ghaddejnihom lil Projects Malta.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Min?

Ix-Xhud :

Bazikament lil John Valenzia li kien jiehu hsieb l-administration, u nahseb ovvjament ic-Chairman William Wait.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

U lil William Wait.

Ix-Xhud :

U ovvjament is-segretarju tal-Bord jghaddi kollox lil... ghalhekk hemm is-segretarju biex jghaddi .

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Min kien is-segretarju tal-Bord?

Ix-Xhud :

Aaron Mifsud Bonnici

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

U ghadu hekk sal-lum

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ghadu sal-lum?

Ix-Xhud :

Ghadu sal-lum ...?

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Segretarju

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Le, fuq l-evalutaion Board le. Imma ..

Imhallel A Lofaro :

Le, bhala segretarju.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Aaron Mifsud Bonnici dak iz-zmien ma kienx Direttur tfuq Projects Malta u Company Secretary ta' Projects Malta?

Ix-Xhud :

Ma nafx x' kien; ma nafx x' kien.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

U lanqas li kien l-avukat ta' Konrad Mizzi tal-Ministru?

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena ma nidholx f' affarijiet ohra; jigifieri jiena ..

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ma tistaqsix.

Ix-Xhud :

M' ghandix ghalfejn.

Imhallel A Lofaro :

M' ghandux ghalejn.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Waqt li kontu qed taghmlu l-evaluation ta' l-RFP, intom ivverifikajtu jekk il-bidders u rapprezentanti ta' Vitals kienux diga` kellhom laqghat mal-Prim Ministru Muscat f' Kastilja f' dak iz-zmien?

Ix-Xhud :

Le.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Jigifieri intom ma kontux tafu illi ..

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

.... Shawkat Ali kien diga` iltaqa` Kastilja mal-Prim Ministru

Ix-Xhud :

Le. No ma konniex nafu.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ma kontux tafu.

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

U meta sirtu tafu ..

Ix-Xhud :

Jien ma kontx naf

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

U meta sirt taf illi kien hemm dawn il-laqghat qabel ma hareg l-RFP?

Ix-Xhud :

Skuzi?

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Sirt taf at some point

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Bir-rispett kollu ta! ..

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

...illi kien hemm dawn il-laqghat?

Dr Pawlu Lia :

....fl-ebda mument ma qal li kien jaf dan li qed jigi suggerit lilu issa. Mhux fair lix-xhud qed insaqsu affarijiet biex nitramellaw lilu u ma nafx ghalfejn ghax ma ghandha x' taqsam xejn ma l-iskop ta' inkjesta f' dan kollu. Qeghdin nittolleraw kollox pero` ma ghandu x' jaqsam xejn ma' l-iskop ta' l-Inkjesta. Ghandu x' jaqsam biss ma' skopijiet ta' deputati ta' partit iehor li ghandhom ghanijiet ohra, biss.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Dottore dik narawha ahna

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Bir-rispett kollu, l-inkjesta ghandha ...lix-xhud li ma jigix .. li kif qal xi haga u jibda jiddubita jekk hux veru qal dan li qed tissuggerilu issa ghax ma qalux dak id-diskors.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Point taken

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Mhux fair mhux fair.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Point taken.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Il-fatt il-mistoqsija tieghi kienet jekk sarx jaf ..

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Kienet ...ghax tissuggerilu li jaf xi haga li qatt ma qal li jafha.

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Jimporta?

Dr Pawlu Lia :

U lanqas nafu jekk hux veru..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

U jekk nigu f' dan ..

Dr Pawlu Lia :

U lanqas nafu jekk hux veru ...

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Dottore sekonda; irrifrejzja d-domanda ..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

U jekk hija xi haga li inti ma tafx ghid mall-ewwel ma nafx

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ghidilna ma nafx

Ix-Xhud :

Ghedtilha ghedtilha jien

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Fejn ma jafx qal ma jafx

Ix-Xhud :

Ghedtilha ma nafx.

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Staqsietu ..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

All right; issa bizzejjed

Dr Pawlu Lia :

...meta sirt taf; ma qalx li kien jaf.

Ix-Xhud :

Ezatt.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Jghid li qatt ma sar jaf

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Is-suggeriment gej minn din is-sinjura bir-rispett kollu ..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Jekk ma jimpurtax Dr Lia ma ghandekx ghalfejn tgholli lehnek

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Uuuu!

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

M' ghandekx ghalfen tgholli lehnek

Dr Pawlu Lia :

...tajjeb li jkun on records, ma ghandu x' jaqsam xejn ma' l-iskopjiet ta' din l-inkjesta.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Dak naraw ahna.

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Kulhadd jaf ..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Dak naraw ahna.

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Kulhadd jaf. Imma hawn min ghandu skopjiet ohra u qed jasal ghalihom bl-ghajjnuna ta' din l-inkjesta.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ahna ma nafux

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Imma hana nafu.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Imma ahna ma nafux.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Issa forsi nifhem ahjar l-ittra tal-Prim Ministru Dr Lia.

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Kun fair ..

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Mela erga' aghmel id-domanda

Dr Pawlu Lia :

...kunu fair ... anke ma dak li ma ghandux x' jaqsam

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Taghmilx domandi ipotetici; tista' tissuggerixxi, imma mhux ipotetici

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Fil-public domain hemm informazzjoni ..

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Dak li hu public domain ma ghandekx bzonn li tistaqsih, jekk inhu hekk

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Dottoressa aghmel id-domanda

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Aghmel id-domanda

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Fil-public domain hemm informazzjoni illi l-Prim Ministru qabel ma nharget l-RFP kien diga` kellu laqghat ma' rapprezentanti ta' Vitals Group, il-laqghat kienu jinkludu lil Shawkat Ali. Intom dan kontu tafu bih..?

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena ma kontx naf bih.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Mhux intom, inti kont taf?

Ix-Xhud :

Jien ma kontx naf bih

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Jekk tafx inti

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Daqshekk; ma nafx ghalfejn dan il-fas kollu!

Dr Pawlu Lia :

Ghax diga` wiegbed id-domanda ...

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Iktar domandi

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Jiena fuq il-progett tal-Vitals ma ghandix iktar domandi imma ghandi iktar domandi fuq affarijiet ohra

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Ghandna domanda ahna. Issa dan il-hin ghamilna search fuq dan ..

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Oxley Group

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

..Oxley Group; u telaghlina Oxley Group, pero` ma ghandu x' jaqsam xejn ma' l-isptarijiet. Ma ghandhom l-ebda konnessjoni ma' l-isptarijiet

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Xejn.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Xejn. Dan ghamilnih issa

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Issa ccekjana.

Ix-Xhud :

Ehe.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Issa ccekjana, u lanqas isemmu expertise fl-isptarijiet ..

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Xejn.

Ix-Xhud :

Fil-bid kien hemm imnizel l-investimenti li ghamlu u fejn investew etc. Jigifieri kollox qieghed fil-bid li ssotomettew.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Expertise ma jidhirx li kien hemm.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Fil-website tagghom illum

Ix-Xhud :

Financial qed nghid

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Financial.

Ix-Xhud :

Investors ta' dawn; financial investors; jigifieri mhux huma per se jkunu.. huma financial investment company.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Jinvestu biss.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Huma jinvestu flus biss.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Jinvestu biss.

Ix-Xhud :

Skuzani jekk ma kontx car, yes, investment company .

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Ahajr hekk; grazzi.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Just l-ahhar domanda fuq din. Inti semmejt illi l-persuni illi kienu mahtura biex jaghmlu l-financial analysis kienu Manuel Castagna u Robert Borg. Nghid sew illi Manuel Catagnia kien ukoll impejgat ta' Nexia BT?

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Jekk taf ghidilna.

Ix-Xhud :

Ma nafx le ..

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Ma jafx.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Ma jafx.

Ix-Xhud :

Ma kontx naf jigifieri

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

U Robert Borg kien impejgat jew konness accountant tal-General Workers Union

Ix-Xhud :

Ma nafx lanqas.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ma tafx. Ma ghandix izjed fuq dan il-progett Sur Imhalled

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Issa ghad-DB Group l-ITS site ..

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Chairman Imhallelf M Mallia :

Is-sit ta' l-ITS, x' tista' tghidilna? Kif kont involut fiha din?

Ix-Xhud :

Kif ghedt qabel, dan irrezjenja c-Chairman tan- negotiation committee u din id-darba Projects Malta baghtu lili biex nirriplejsja lic-Chairman ta' qabli.

Imhallelf A Lofaro :

U erga' ghidilna d-data please?

Ix-Xhud :

November tat-2015 jekk minhiex sejjer zball, jekk niftakar sew.

Imhallelf A Lofaro :

Ok.

Chairman Imhallelf M Mallia :

Iva; u x' gara?

Ix-Xhud :

Le bazikament ic-Chairman ta' qabli tani handover fejn kienu waslu bhala kumitat. U dawn kienu fil-process ovvjament li qabdu esperti biex jaghmlu evalwazzjoni dettaljata verament kemm tiswa l-art, u bazikament kien gharrafni li kienu informaw lil Projects Malta biex jingaggjaw lil xi hadd.

Imhallelf A Lofaro :

Biex jistma l-art.

Ix-Xhud :

Ehe. Projects Malta sa fejn naf jien milli niftakar gabu stimi u ghazlu lil Deliotte biex ikun jista' jassistimhux.. prattikament esperti f' dan il-qasam.

Imhallelf J Said Pullicino :

Biex nifhem ukoll ta; din tad-DB, dina kienet public private partnership jew kien hemm element ta' investment privat mal-gvern jew le?

Ix-Xhud :

Le dan bazikament its a mix tourism marketing tas-sit ta' fejn kienet l-ITS qabel

Imhallelf J Said Pullicino :

Ehe, imma jigifieri kien hemm element fil-progett kolli ta' investment privat mal-gvern jew le? Min-naha ta' Projects Malta qed nghid issa jien

Ix-Xhud :

Ovvjament dan mhux bhal l-isptarijiet, dan...

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Iva; zomm sekonda; ghedtilna l-ewwel u mhux inti biss u haddiehor ukoll, intom inhloqtu biex ikun hemm ..

Ix-Xhud :

Iva iva; imma kif ghedna, il-valwazzjoni ta' l-art, dan irid ihallas il-gvern ta' l-art li..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Naqblu naqblu

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Imma issa qed nigu ghal progett.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Dana d-domanda kienet semplici; jinvolvi element ta' investment tal-gvern fil-progett jew le?

Ix-Xhud :

No.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

No.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

No. Mill-privat biss.

Ix-Xhud :

Privat biss.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Ma kienx hemm partnership bejniethom pero` xorta dhaltu intom bhala Projects Malta b' xi mod.

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena mhux Projects Malta; jiena dhalt bhala.. ghedtlek, qabduni Projects Malta, jien mhux ..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Imma kien f' idejn Projects Malta hu

Ix-Xhud :

Projects Malta qabdet lili.

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Iva imma l-progett

Ix-Xhud :

Kien f' idejn Projects Malta

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Heq! U kif gie ghand Projects Malta inti ma tafx, mhux hekk?

Ix-Xhud :

...

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Sewwa. U dhalt biss f' dan l-aspett ta' valuation prattikament

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Imhallee J Said Pullicino :

Dik storja ohra, ma ghandhiex x' taqşam maghna, inhalluha ghaddejja band' ohra.

Imhallee A Lofaro :

Kont Chairman tan-negotiation committee?

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Imhallee A Lofaro :

Inti kont ic-Chairman dak iz-zmien

Ix-Xhud :

Le, irriplejsajt lil ta' qabli.

Imhallee A Lofaro :

U l-valutazzjoni ta' l-art u tas-sit saret qabel jew wara li ntaghzel il-bid?

Ix-Xhud :

Il-bid intaghzel u mbaghad saru n-negozjati.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Ok; mela wara.

Ix-Xhud :

Jigifieri ghalhekk imbaghad tqabdu Deloitte biex jaghmlu....

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Mela l-ewwel intaghzel il-bid u mbaghad saret il-valuation ta' l-art.

Ix-Xhud :

Ezatt. Ta' l-art

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

U fil-process tal-bid inti ma dhaltx

Ix-Xhud :

Skuzi?

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Fil-process tal-bid ma dhaltx; ghax inti tevalwa biss kont.

Ix-Xhud :

Ezatt. Le jiena fil-kumitat.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Tal-bid? Jigifieri taf kemm ibbidjaw ghall-art? Dhalt fiha din? Kont taf?

Ix-Xhud :

Iva, jien membru kont.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Tal- ... committee

Ix-Xhud :

Ta' l-evaluation committee

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Imma l-evaluation saret wara li dahlu l-bids jew qabel?

Ix-Xhud :

Le.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Iva diga` qal li wara.

Ix-Xhud :

Il-valuation saret ..

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Wara.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Wara.

Ix-Xhud :

Inti ovvjament ..fin-negozjati inqabdu Deloitte biex johorgu a fair price ta' l-art.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Wara li intaghzel il-bidder. Diga` wegibha ta. Wiegeb lili.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Jigifieri jekk nistaqsik il-bidding process ma' min sar ma tafx jekk hux ma' Process Malta jew ma' xi Ministeru iehor? Il-bidding process biex tintaghzel dik il-persuna.

Ix-Xhud :

Il-bidding process kien hemm evaluation committee u ghazlu lil DB bhala preferred bidder.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

U inti f` dan ma kontx.

Ix-Xhud :

Iva membru kont.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Kont membru

Ix-Xhud :

Kont membru, mhux Chairman imma

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Inti kont membru. U sar dak il-process minn Projects Malta allura.

Ix-Xhud :

Yes.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Ehe. Hemm xi domanda fuq l-ITS?

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Qed nipprova nifhem; inti kont membru ta' l-evaluation committee jew tan-negotiation committee?

Ix-Xhud :

Ta' l-evaluation.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ta' l-valuation committee. In-negotiation committee min kien? Min kienu l-membri tan-negotiation committee?

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena...

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Tan-negotiation committee.

Ix-Xhud :

Iva iva, tan-negotiation.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

In-negożjar.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Mela negotiation committee kontu inti, ..

Ix-Xhud :

Dr Alex Sciberras, u Peter Zammit.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Mela inti kont membru fin-negotiation committee imma kont ukoll fl-evaluation committee?

Ix-Xhud :

Le, ghax ...qlibthom!

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ghax ghalhekk qeghdin ..

Ix-Xhud :

Kont Chairman fin-negotiation u membru fl-evaluation

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Kotn fit-tnejn mela.

Ix-Xhud :

Iva.

Imhallef A Lofaro :

Yes kien fi tnejn, yes

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ok. Daqshekk. L-evaluation committee min kienu?

Ix-Xhud :

L-evaluation kien hemm Chairman George Gregory, kien hemm Mario Galea...

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

U inti.

Ix-Xhud :

Jiena, u ma nafx jekk hux xi hadd Gaerty, ma nafx x' jismu.

Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :

Gaerty

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Marvin Gaerty?

Ix-Xhud :

Ma nafx, ma niftakarx

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ok. Thank you,

Imhallef J Said Pullicino :

Sakemm dont fi Projects Malta inti l-Ministeru min kien? Taht liema Ministeru kontu taqghu?

Ix-Xhud :

Tat-Turizmu.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Ghad-DB ..

Ix-Xhud :

Skuzi?

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Il-Projects Malta taht liema Ministeru jaqa’

Ix-Xhud :

Inti ghedtli meta kont hemm jien, le?

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Il-Projects Malta.

Ix-Xhud :

Meta kont nahdem Projects Malta

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Ehe ehe.

Ix-Xhud :

Taht Ministry of Tourism.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Of Tourism?

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Dejjem.

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Li kien allura taht il-Ministru Mizzi?

Ix-Xhud :

Yes yes

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Qatt kellkom bhala Projects Malta kunattt dirett mal-Ministeru? Jew kellek ...

Ix-Xhud :

Ahna dejjem through il-Permanent Secretary nimxu

Imhalled J Said Pullicino :

Dejjem through the Permanent Secretary

Ix-Xhud :

Yes

Imhalled A Lofaro :

U ghal finanzi? Mal-Ministeru tal-Finanzi kien hemm kuntatt?

Ix-Xhud :

Kuntatt fuq xoghol ovvjament hu.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Ehe. Mal-Ministru jew mal-perm sec.

Ix-Xhud :

Le through the office of the perm sec.

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Perm sec.

Ix-Xhud :

Le meta per ezempju tiddijlja bhal.. taf inti, tahdem ma' entitajiet differenti governattivi .

Imhalled A Lofaro :

Hekk hu. Dejjem mal-Permanent Secretary

Ix-Xhud :

Mhux Permanent Secretary tal-Finanzi. Man-nies, man-nies li jahdmu l-finanzi, fhimt?

Imhalled A Lofaro :

I see ok.

Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :

Gazzi hafna.

Din hija s-sustanza tax-xhieda ta' **James Camenzuli** kif giet dettata minnu stess fil-prezenza ta' l-istess xhud.

Niddikjara li traskrivejt bl-ahjar hila tieghi x-xhieda ta' l-istess xhud.

Saviour Scicluna

Traskrittur