

**L-Atti tal-Inkjesta datata 19 ta' Novembru 2019, rigward skont it-Termini ta' Referenza ta' l-Inkjesta Pubblika dwar l-Assassinju ta' Daphne Caruana Galizia.**

**Seduta miżmuma illum it-Tnejn 7 ta' Dicembru 2020, fis-1:00 p.m. fit-Tieni Sular, Awla 20, il-Qorti.**

Xhud **Jonathan Cardona** iben Louis u Josephine nee Falzon imwielda Pieta` u residenti r-Rabat Malta bil-Malti u bil-gurament tieghu jghid :

**Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :**

X' taghmel illum Sur Cardona?

**Ix-Xhud :**

Jiena bhala issa kap eskuttiv ta' agenija li ghadha kif inholqot issa li tiehu over ix-xoghol tal-MIPA, jigifieri qed Kap Ezekuttiv tal-Community Malta Agency.

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Community Malta Agency.

**Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :**

U xi tkun din?

**Ix-Xhud :**

Bazikament hija agenzija gdida ghas-set up daqs gimaghtejn ilu tliet gimghat ilu; li tiehu hsieb ic-cittadinanza, il-process li tramite minnu tinghata c-cittadinanza lil terzi persuni through all the different roots, jigifieri ..

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Jigifieri jew through marriage..

**Ix-Xhud :**

Through marriage, long stay, through descent, through dak li kien IIP, kollox.

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Imma dak li kien IIP illum x' jissejjah please?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Mela l-IIP wasal biex jinghalaq; issa m' ghandux isem, ha nghidu hekk, issa hemm sett ta' regolamenti godda illi fejn tinghata.. l-ispirtu hu li tinghata c-cittadinanza tramite investment eccezzjonali through exceptional services by direct investment.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Jigifieri wara li gie emendata l-iskema, hux?

***Ix-Xhud :***

L-iskema qed tinghalaq u infetah xi haga gdida.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Ok; ghadha ma inghalqitx.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ghadha ma inghalqitx ghax hemm affarijiet in process; allura qabel qishom ma jinghalqu dawk difficli biex taghlaqa' kompletament ghax inkella...

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

U kif kienet qabel inti kont incharge wkoll?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva iva.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Grazzi.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Jigifieri ghamilt zmien kont CEO tal-programm ta' IIP.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ezatt; bhal issa qeghdin in transition jigifieri qbadtuna f' mument ta' transition bejn wahda u ohra.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Mela qablek kien hemm haddiehor.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Le.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Jien ma bdejtx mill-bidu nett, imma qabel kienet fil-passat ma' Identity Malta u hemmhekk kien hemm l-Executive Chairman Joe Vella Bonnici illi konna niehdu hsieb flimkien, ha nghidu hekk.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Inti kont tahdem hemm xorta u kont tghinu.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ezatt ezatt.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Ok.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Ahna li jinteressana r-relazzjoni tieghek ma' Christian Kaelin u Henley and Partners. Dan kif kont tafu? Min introduciek mieghu; u imbaghad ghandek skambji ta' emails li rrid insaqsik xi domandi fuqhom.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Dan kien introducut mieghi... introdott mieghi round about Jannar.. fil-bidu ta' Jannar tat-2014. Dak iz-zmien jien kont kap tas-segretarjat tad-Deputy Prim Minister u minhabba li l-issue kienet eskalat.. insomma minn dejjem kient daqsxejn ..

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Li kien dak iz-zmien id-Deputy Prim Minister kien ..?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Louis Grech.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Louis Grech ok.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Jien kont Head of Secretariat tieghu. U peress li s-suggett kien eskala u sar pjuttost kontrovesjali u kien anke lahaq il-livelli Ewropej kienu introducewni mieghu..., ezatti l-persuna min niftakar qaluli biex nattendu meeting Kastilja, hu kien qiegħed hemmhekk ma' numri ta' persuni ohra; u sirt nafu hekk.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Lil dan Kaelin hux hekk?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Lil dan Chris Kaelin iva. Ir-relazzjoni tieghi mieghu hi wahda preofessjonali, it's quite drive, ma jkollix hafna.. especially as we went along fil-bidu until we set-up kien hemm exchanges ghax anke jien kont qed nitghallem u nifhem x' qeghdin nipprovaw naghmlu, pero` as we went along u ahna hadna iktar kontroll tas-sitwazzjoni iktar kont niktellem man-nies taghhom li kellhom hawn Malta, mat-team taghhom li kien hawn Malta milli maghhom jew mas-senior management.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

U min kienu t-team taghhom hawn Malta?

***Ix-Xhud :***

It-team taghhom hawn Malta nahseb l-iktar li ghamel zmien twil huwa certu Stuart McFeeters, kien barrani jmexxi l-ufficcju taghhom Malta, u kien hemm perjodu wiehed Ingliz, jidhirli Ingliz Mark Stannard li minn ghandu tghallimt hafna, bniedem eks bankier, eks HSBC, bniedem rettissimu u kont tghallimt hafna hafna minn ghandu.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Issa fil-31 ta' Mejju tat-2017 is-sinjura Caruana Galizia kienet ippubblikat skambju ta' emails bejnek, Christian Kaelin ta' Henley and Partners, Keith Schembri, Joseph Muscat allura Prim Ministru, u Owen Bonnici li kien Ministru tal-Gustizzja. Li kienu jikellmu dwar proceduri legali kontra Daphne Caruana Galizia. Wahda minnhom tghid hekk : *Dear Owen and Jonathan*, Jonathan qed jirreferi ghalik nimmagina.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

*We have as agreed looked into the matter to.. voldieri 'as agreed', jigifieri diga` kontu tkellimtu qabel, looked onto you matter to .. and if needed action a defamation case against Jason Azzopardi and Daphne Caruana.., and conclude that Henley and Partners UK Limited would be the entity bringing such a case forward. X' kont qed tiddiksuti ma' Henley and Partners u kif ukoll mal-Ministru tal-Gustizzja biex tistotwixxu dawn il-proceduri? Ghaliex indirizza lil Owen u lilek?*

***Ix-Xhud :***

Mela dak kellna..., huma occasionally qisu darba maximum darbtejn f' sena Chris Kaelin u persuna ohra senior fil-kumpanija taghhom jigu Malta u jaghmlu meeting mal-Ministru li jkun responsabbli mill-programm. Dak iz-

zmien kien il-Ministru Owen Bonnici u kien hemm meeting ta' kortesija. A half an hour meeting more or less. U fost numru ta' topics Chris Kaelin kien semma.. kien qisu illamenta dwar kitbiet li kienu qed isiru dwar il-kumpanija tieghu mis-sinjura Caruana Galizia ghax bdew ihossuhom malafamati etc. Huma kienu urew ix-xewqa illi jifthu kawzi kontriha. Min-naha tieghu l-Onorevoli Bonnici kien ta l-opinjoni illi normalment mhux nifthu kawza imma nibaghtu ittra; jigifieri ma jmorru ghal kawza imma l-ewwel tintbaghat ittra, u more or less dak kien l-ezitu. Jigifieri naf illi l-perspettiva ta' haddiehor taf tkun differenti u nifhimha. Pero` mill-prespettiva kif kont qed narhom jien bid-diskussjoni li kien hemm ma' l-Onorevoli Bonnici hassejt li kien hemm de-escalation daqsxejn tas-sitwazzjoni..

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

De- escalation.

***Ix-Xhud :***

De-escalation.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

De-escalation.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ghaliex filli dawn kienu qeghdin gew qishom bi frame of mind illi jixtiequ jifthu.. jaqbdu u jifthu kawza, u bl-opinjoni li kellu Owen Bonnici at least intbaghtet ittra. Issa tghidli ittra sabieha? Ifhimni illi..

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Jigifieri qishom ipperswadihom il-Ministru.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Hadu l-opinjoni tieghu. Ma nistax nghidlek li pperswadihom ...

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

U iva.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ghax ipperswadihom hija kelma kbira. Imma..

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Ikkonvincihom

***Ix-Xhud :***

Kien hemm rating illi flok imorru ghal kawza jmorru ghal ittra. Sa fejn naf jien, sa fejn naf jien dawn spiccaw li kawza qatt ma nfethet kontra hadd as far as I know. Jiena ma bqajtx.. I didn't follow it further ha nghidlek il-verita`.; pero` as far as I know., kienx hekk iktar komunikazzjoni ma nafx. Pero` kawza qatt ma naf jew li smajt li nfethet.

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

L-avukat Inglizi Mishcon de Reya, dawk kienu imqabbd minnhom minn Henley and Partners jew..

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva..

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Jew minn ghandkom?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le le. Avukati taghhom, le mhux taghna

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Dawk l-avukati taghhom.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva.

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Min iddecieda li jqabbd avukati Inglizi? Ghax kien hawn avukati Maltin li setghu iqabbd.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Huma. Le dawn gew b' xi haga huma. Huma.

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Intom issuggerjtu ghal li jista' jkun illi jqabbd avukati Maltin?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Difficli biex niftakar

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Jekk tiftakar

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Li tiftakar.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Difficli biex niftakar; din ilha erba' snin.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Jekk tiftakar, jekk le ma tiftakrx.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Difficli biex niftakar. Li niftakar illi qisu l-ispirtu illi don't go for a case, write a letter.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Il-Ministru hekk qalilhom.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ehe xi haga f' dak is-sens.

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

Il-kawza kellha tinfetah Malta jew barra?

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Jaf li ma nfethix.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Fl-ittra qalu li ser jifthuha barra. Fl-ittra qalu li ser jifhtuha barra hemmhekk.

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

Imma l-hsieb taghhom kien ser jaghmluh kawza l-Ingilterra jew hawn?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Nahseb barra kienu ser jifthuha huma.

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

Barra ...

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

L-Ingilterra.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Nahseb barra, nahseb l-Ingilterra kienu ser jifthuha.

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

....Malta?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ghax huma ma riedux ... li qed isir Malta biss. Jidhirli li huma kienu ghaddejjin b' xi progetti ohra u hassew illi l-artikoli kienu qeghdin jaghmillu il-hsara barra; u b' hekk ahna ghedna isma' – write a letter; ghax dik kienet tkun go large.

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

....

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Qrajnihomlu, le? Wahda qrajnielu.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Dawn il-pubblikazzjonijiet li kienu qeghdin isiru kienu qed isiru Malta mhux barra minn Malta; kienu qed isiru hawn, ok? U jidher illi kien Kaelin stess illi ddiwedda illi jaghmel il-kawzi jekk kien ser jasal ghaliha go l-Ingilterra. Hawnhekk jghidilna – *this was discussed with Keith, Jonathan, Owen and PM, who all support the section, in fact it was them who suggested it.* Intom ..

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

...it was them who suggested it.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Intom issuggerjtu li jekk tinfetah kawza tinfetah l-Ingilterra u mhux Malta, Ghaliex dan?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le ta.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Hekk qed jghid hu. Hu qed jghidha din.

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

...

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Imma din l-email qed jghid illi gie diskuss mieghu; mieghek x' gie diskuss?



***Ix-Xhud :***

Mieghi gie diskuss il-kuncett li kienu ser jifthu ..; terga' lanqas kien mieghi; kienu qed jittkellmu ma' l-Onorevoli Owen Bonnici u jien kont prezenti ghal meeting. Li kienu ser jifthu kawza, li gie diskuss illi huma kienu qed ihossuhom ingurjati b' dak li qed jghid fuqhom, xtaqu jifthu kawza u bazikament l-opinjoni ta' Dr Bonnici kienet illi jaghmlu ittra u mhux jifthu kawza.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Li jaghmlu ittra.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Pero` tinsiex ukoll illi huma qalu f' dawn l-emails illi dawn l-artikoli ghalihom ma ghamlilhom l-ebda hsara eh!

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

..

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Hawnhekk, *there has been no financial or reputational laws for Henley and Partners UK. This negative / have not been mentioned by any prospective client or agent in our office;* and yet dawn iddecidew illi jaghmlu l-kawza l-Ingilterra, lanqas hawn.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ma nistax inwiegbek. Ma nistax inwiegbek fuqha din.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Jghidu meta staqsejtu intom - *why was Malta not chosen instead* , dawn jghidu - *Malta is cumbersome and politically problematic.*

***Ix-Xhud :***

U min qalha dik.. mhux jiena imma; zgur li mhux jien ta.

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

....

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Hekk hu; jekk jiftkarhom jiftakarhom.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Inti tiftakarhom din l-exchange?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Jiena li niftakar email wahda twila, dik. Ma nafx jekk kontx involut fl-exchange kollha ta' emails dejjem ikkupjat; ma niftakarx onestament nghidlek.

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Pero` fejn dawn jirreferu ghalik, *this was discussed with Keith, Jonathan, Owen* etc., meta jghid Jonathan qed jirreferi....

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ghalija ghalija, iva iva.

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Qed jirreferi ghalik.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva mela..

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Tiftakar illi qed tiddiskuti magghom fuq din il-materja

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

...

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Xejn ma tkellimt inti? Xejn xejn?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ghaddew erba' snin.

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ghidilna; mhux inti qed tixhed?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ghaddew erba' snin, difficli biex niftakar li ghedt xi haga jew le..

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Prova ftakar; li tiftakar tiftakar.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Hi l-probabbilta' hi li nkun qbilt ma' Dr Bonnici illi ghandha tintbaghat ittra u mhux tinfetah kawza; ha nkun onest mieghek. Jigifieri l-andament..

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Jigifieri inti dik biss li tiftakar; dik biss.

**Ix-Xhud :**

Dik; ghax din kienet diskussjoni vera qasira, couple of minutes, jigifieri ma kienx hemm xi session. This was just a couple of minutes discussion

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

U din l-email ma tiftakarhiex?

**Ix-Xhud :**

L-email li niftakar dik it-twila ghax imbaghad niftakar li giet published....

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Kien hemm xi bicca li tghid hekk? Jew ma tiftakarx? Jew le? Ara, jew iva, jew le jew ma tiftakarx.

**Ix-Xhud :**

Ara, l-email li niftakar hi email ta' Chris Kaelin, hemm wahda twila ghax imbaghad dik kienet giet published. Dik il-wahda niftakarha. Oltre minn hekk ma nafx jekk qattx jiena kont involut f' iktar emails. Mhux qed nghidlek le. Ma niftakarx jekk kontx involut f' iktar emails.

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Jigifieri li l-kawza kienet idea taghkom, ghax semma lilek ukoll;

**Ix-Xhud :**

Le zgur li le ta.

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

... din ma tiftakarhiex jew tichadha?

**Ix-Xhud :**

Le le ma kinetx idea taghna.

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Mela qed jichad. Ix-xhud qed jichad.

**Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :**

L-allegazzjoni qieghda li hu kien qed jippartecipa f' dawn id-diskussjonijiet.

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Fid-diskussjonijiet.

***Imhallef J Said Pullicino :***

....

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ehe, hekk xehed il-Ministru.

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

..

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Il-Ministru Bonnici xehed.

***Imhallef J Said Pullicino :***

.....

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Hekk qalilna iva. Il-Ministru hekk qal.

***Imhallef J Said Pullicino :***

.....issa imbaghad .... taghha

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Peress illi meta xehed il-Ministru li kien prezenti ghal din il-laqgha ma qalx l-istess affarijiet li qed jghid issa..

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ehe, piu` o meno qal hekk. Piu` o meno.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Ma qalx l-istess affarijiet. Il-Ministru qal meta indikajna.. hu l-Ministru qal illi hu lanqas biss irrisponda ghal dawn l-emails, u kellu jivverfika..

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ehe, qalha dik.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

U kellu jivverifika jekk ghandux dawn l-emails; u jidhirli li sa issa ma gewx prezentati.

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Le ma qalilna xejn; le le

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

..u ma gewx ivverifikati.

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

....

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Allura forsi x-xhud jghidilna meta l-ahhar iddiskuta dawn l-emails mal-Ministru.

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

..

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Dak mhux inti x-xhud; mhux inti ix-xhud.

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

..

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Mhux inti x-xhud.

**Chairman Imhallel M Mallia :**

Aghmel id-domanda.

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Mhux inti x-xhud.

**Imhallel J Said Pullicino :**

Dottoressa, l-importanti s-sustanza, x' qal il-Ministru ghandna.

**Imhallel A Lofaro :**

Ezatt; ghandna x-xhieda bil-gurament.

**Imhallel J Said Pullicino :**

...inqabbluh, jigifieri mhux problema, tajjeb?

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Jiena ninnota li meta tqabblu mhux qed jghidu l-istess.

**Imhallel J Said Pullicino :**

L-iktar importanti hu li jikkonferma li l-emails huma .....; jekk dawn huma l-emails kollox jitkellem wahdu.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Fhimtu l-Bord, fhimtu.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Qal wiehed twil.

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

Wiehed twil.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ehe wiehed twil; dak li gie published.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Dak li gie published.

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

.. out of all proportion bir-rispett kollu

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Mhux hekk?! Ghandek xi domandi?

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

...

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Ghandek xi domanda?

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Ehe fuq dan il-kwistjoni nixtieq insaqsi lix-xhud jekk is-Sur Piscopo kienx aware illi kienu l-avukati Inglizi stess illi avzaw lil Henley and Partners illi kawza barra diffiqli taghmilha ghax il-pregudizzju il-kriterju tal-pregudizzju ma kienx sodisfatt

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Cardona? Min qed jghid Cardona?

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Is-Sur Cardona.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Ehe, m'intix tisma...

**Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :**

Erga' aghmillu d-domanda

**Imhallef J Said Pullicino :**

Mhux qed nifhem..

**Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :**

Erga' aghmillu d-domanda ghax ma fehmeqx

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

Ix-xhud mhux jifhmek.

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Fl-email.. ix-xhud kien ikkupjat f' dawn l-emails; issa wahda minn l-emails, kif anke qara s-Sur Imhallef, tindika illi l-avukati barranin taw parir lil Henley and Partners illi l-kriterju tal-pregudizzju ma kienx sodisfatt biex tinfetah kawza l-Ingilterra. In vista li x-xhud qal illi kienu huma stess illi qalu biex ma tibdiex kawza imma tintbaghat ittra biss. Nitlob lix-xhud jindika jekk kienx jaf b' dan il-parir ta' Mishcon de Reya

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

Kont tarf bih il-parir.....

**Ix-Xhud :**

Le le

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

... li tawhom l-avukati?

**Ix-Xhud :**

L-ewwel darba li qed nimaghha din.

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

Ma kienx jaf.

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Ix-xhud kien jaf illi minkejja illi ma nfethix kawza saru diversi tentattivi u theddid anke b' diversi ittri fuq Daphne Caruana Galizia biex tneghi l-pubblikazzjonijiet li kienet ippubblikat?

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

Mela l-ittri lil min kienu mibghutha? L-ittri mibghutha lil..

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Skont il-blogs illi diga` gew prezentati lilha stess, anke fil-laqghat maghha.

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Taf li kien hemm ittri li baghtuhom lil Daphne Caruana Galizia?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le.

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

..u heddewha ?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le.

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ma tafx.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Il-laqghat illi kienu jsiru, inti ghedtilna illi kienu jsiru laqghat qisu darba fis-sena dartbejn fis-sena?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

F' dawn il-laqghat kienu jinzammu minuti tagghom?

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Kontu zzommu minuti tal-laqghat?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le.

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Minutes

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le le ma kienx jinzamm; ghax kien.. ha nghidu hekk, meta jkunu laqghat mieghi l-bicca l-kbira jkunu laqghat operattiv, jigifieri mank xi haga li..



***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ma kienx ikun hemm il-Ministru Owen Bonnici mieghek?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Meta nkun mal-Ministru min-naha tieghi ma nzommx. Jekk jinzammu min-naha tal-Ministru. Mhux xi haga li ha nzomm jiena.

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Init ma zzommx.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le jiena ma nzommx.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Inti ghedt ukoll illi f' dawn il-laqghat kien ikun hemm persuna oħra minn Henley and Partners apparti Christian Kaelin, min kien din il-persuna?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Gie li kien jattendi Yorg Stefan

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Yorg Stefan.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ehe, illum qieghed is-CEO ta' l-agent tal-kumpanija tagħhom.

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ta' Henley and Partners

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ezatt.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Inti ghedt ukoll illi l-ewwel darba li iltqajt ma' Christian Kaelin kien f' laqgha li giet imsejha f' Kastilja.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ezatt.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Min kien prezenti għal dik il-laqgha min-naha tal-gvern?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Min-naha tal-gvern jidhirli li kien hemm Dr Owen Bonnici, l-AG, dawk li niftakar zgur; ghax dawk imbaghad konna sifirna magghom morna Brussels wara. Imma dawk li niftakar.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

U dan kien meta inti kont ghadek ser tinhatar CEO tal-programm jew qabel?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Qabel qabel.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Qabel ma nhtart

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Allura ssejjaht ghall-liema skop?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Issejjaht ghax peress li jiena kont il-Head of Secretariat fuq affarijiet mad-Deputat Prim Ministru li taht ir-remit tieghu kien hemm EU affairs, u li l-issue kollha eskalat anke ma' l-EU Commission u kien hemm meeting.. ma nafx jekk tiftakru, ma' l-ufficju ta' Vivienne Reddit li kienet il-Vice President tal-Commission ta' qabel Juncker, peress li jiena.. jiena ridt nitla' f' dik il-vesti nirrapprezenta lill-gvern Malti fuq din l-issue.

***Imhallelf A Lofaro :***

Tlajtu Brussell.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Allura ehe. Kont jien li...

***Imhallelf A Lofaro :***

U gie maghkom ghedtli.

***Ix-Xhud :***

...nitla' nirrapprezenta lill-gvern Malti imma f' dik il-vesi, mhux ghax dan il-... gie li jkolli affarijiet li ma ghadnix x' naqsam magghom ..

***Imhallelf A Lofaro :***

U kontu ma' l-AG?

***Ix-Xhud :***

F' dan il-kaz iva kien tela' l-AG.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Jigifieri dan iz-zmien meta r-regoli kienu ghadhom ma dahlux fis-sehh fil-ligi Maltija?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ha nghidlek, id-dati ezatt ezatt.. ghax tant kienu vicini; imma ma rridx nigdiblek, jigifieri they were very close.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Imma fil-bidu.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ehe, dawk kienu ghax l-ewwel gew published sett ta' ligijiet jidhirli f' Dicembru, u imbaghad gew emendati.

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

..

***Ix-Xhud :***

Imma ezattament kif id-dati ma..; imma ssibhom hemm.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Pero` fil-bidu. Fil-bidu.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Imma fil-bidu; kien ghadu fil-bidu. Imma ezatt is-sequences of events ma nafx nghidlek bl-amment.

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Jiena xtaqt insaqi domanda ohra fuq kwistjoni differenti. Bazikament jekk ix-xhud jistax jikkonferma jekk hu kienx registrat jew ghadux registrat bhala amministratur ta' josephmuscat. Com ..

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

U din jx' ghandha x' taqsam..!

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

... 'il ghaliex dokumetanzjoni ..

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

...

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

..ara, wiehed irid jara ukoll fil-linji tat-terms of refernce mhux ta' impunita` imma anke ta' kif tagixxi l-governanza fil-pajjiz, kemm persuna li jkollha certu hatriet f' ufficcji pubblici jistghu wkoll jiddeffsu lilhom innfushom f' karigi politici partigjani. U minn informazzjoni li hemm available online jidher illi dan kien hu stess li kien registrat bhala amministrator bil-fax number indikat li huwa ta' missier Joseph Muscat, imma hemm isem Jonathan Cardona bhala administrative organization. Jigifieri jekk ix-xhud jikkonferma u jekk ghadux.

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

M' ghandha x' taqsam xejn..

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Jiena d-domanda ghamiltha, jiddeciedi l-Bord. L-aqwa li d-domanda ghamiltha

**Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :**

Ara din aqtughha tad-domanda politici. Aqtughha. Hawnhekk ma hawnx politika.

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

..

**Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :**

All right?

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

Ahna zgur li le.

**Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :**

Hawn m' hawnx politika

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

.. hekk biss jidher

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

Mhux sewwa Dr Lia.

**Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :**

Kull ma tridu taghmlu biex twaqqfu domanda.. toqghodu tghidu li hija politika; u twaqqfuha, all right? U hawnhekk ma nimxux.. .

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

...nuqqas ta' rispett; domando li ma ghadhom x' jaqsmu xejn ma .... Referenza, ghal kurzita`; gahl skopijiet .....

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

Dr Lia m aghadniex hin x' naqlu jahasra ..

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

... biex jaghtu botta politika; mhux bilfors imbaghad..

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

Ahna qeghdin hawnhekk .. ..

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

.....mhux perjodu illi jinkludi lill-amministrazzjonijiet kollha ....

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Jiena l-inqas mara kurjuza li hawn fid-dinja. Pero` l-mistoqsija hija dwar kif persuni li jokkupaw hatriet pubblici mhallsin mit-taxxa tal-poplu imbaghad ikunu qeghdin jaghmlu wkoll xoghol politiku partigjan fl-istess hin. U din turi network shiha kif rajna fix-xhieda kollha li ittelghet quddiem din l-Inkjesta.

**Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :**

Inti ghandek id-dokument li juri li kien amminsitratur hux.

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Iva.

**Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :**

Mela leave it at that.

**Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :**

Ok

**Imhallef A Lofaro :**

Toqghodx issaqsi domanda; daqshekk..

**Dr Pawlu Lia :**

.....

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ir-relevanza Dr Lia ser narawha ta.

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

...il-punt huwa x' ghandha x' taqsam ...

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Issa mbaghad dik narawha ahna..

***Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :***

Kienet tkun izjed facli kieku x-xhud qabad u kkonferma milli ..

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Dr Lia, il-gudikant meta jigi biex jikteb is-sentenza jkollu hafna xhieda quddiemu; jislet hu x' inhu relevanti u x' ma huwiex. Ahna mhux qeghdin hawnhekk biex naghmlu xi haga tal-politka! Jien ghandi xoghol iehor ta', fulltime.

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

...

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Qed tifhem? U din il-kritika tweggaghani, ghax mhux veru; kieku kienet veru nghid haqqni; imma mhux veru ..

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

..

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Imma mhux ahna qed inwassluh zgur.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Mela Sur Cardona, ara jekk naqblux f' Jannar ..

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

...

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Issa ghedt bizzejjed; bizzejjed, ha nisimghu d-domanda ..

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ma naghmlux domandi politici.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Bhala fatt. F' Jannar ta' l-2014 naqblu u tiftakar illi kien hemm laqgħa mal-Kummissarju Redding.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ma' l-istaff tagħha mhux magħha.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Ma' l-istaff tagħha. Niftakar sew għax kont fuq l-ajruplan magħhom, b' hekk niftakar. Issa kien hemm l-AG Peter Grech

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Il-Ministru Bonnici..

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

U kien hemm persuna oħra .

***Ix-Xhud :***

Kien hemm xi nies ...

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Ha nikkoregi, għandek ragun, skuzani. Kien hemm persuna oħra mad-delegazzjoni mhux Malti li tkellem f' isem il-gvern Malti mal-Commission.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Mela kien hemm..

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Jiena naf min hu, ha nipprova nara jekk tasalx għalih.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Chris Kaelin kien qieghed hemmhekk.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Correct.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Kien hemm Eric Major, pero` ma tkellmox .

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

...Dr Lia; jislet ir-relevanza ..

***Ix-Xhud :***

..

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Minuta, ghax l-avukat tieghek qed itellef lill-Bord; skuzani ftit.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

..u mhux bilfors ser tkun inkuza din.

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

Jekk il-gvern kellu konsulent u ma ghadhomx relevanza ghal din l-Inkjesta ghaliex naghmluha aktar difficli li.. konsulent ...

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Hu kien konsulent jigifieri?

***Dr Pawlu Lia :***

Ma nafx ..

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Inti kont konsulent?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Sorry?

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Kont konsulent?

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Le.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Le le le.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Le ma jidhirlix li kien konsulent. Le.



***Ix-Xhud :***

Le le

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

Dottore aghmel id-domanda

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Aghmel id-domanda

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Ha naraw jekk hijiex irrelevanti; ejja.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Jiena inzertajt imdorri hafna f' ambjent iehor li mhux ser itellefini min qed jipprova itellef. Il-professur Cocinov kien parti mid-delegazzjoni?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Iva wkoll.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Iva.

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

U x' inhi r-relevanza?

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Ehe, x' inhi r-relevanza? Lanqas naf min hu dan!

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Issa l-professur Cocinov kien konsulent ta' Henley?

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Cocinov kien konsulent?

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

U zgur, harget fil-parlament.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Li kien. .

***Imhalled J Said Pullicino :***

Dr Azzopardi..

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Harget fil-parlament pubblika.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Li kien advisor maghna iva; li jekk huwiex magghom ma nafx.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Ma tafx.

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Ma hijiex relevanti ta' din.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Ma tafx.

***Imhallef J Said Pullicino :***

Dr Azzopardi, ghal fini ta' din l-inkjesta x' relevanza ghandha ..?

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Ghaliex il-konuslent tal-koncessjonarju agixxa ghan-nom tal-gvern Malti f'laqghat mal-Commission; dik ir-raguni.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Hemmhekk mhux korrett; hemmhekk mhux korrett

***Imhallef J Said Pullicino :***

...imma x' inhu ..

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Fejn mhux korrett? Ghidlu ghaliex...

***Ix-Xhud :***

Hu kien advisor imma

***Imhallef A Lofaro :***

Tista' tghidlu ghaliex ma huwiex korrett please?

***Ix-Xhud :***

Ghax mhux ..

***Chairman Imhallef M Mallia :***

Jimporta titkellmu one by one please halli nkunu nistghu nirregistraw? Mhux kulhadd jitkellem f' daqqa!

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Veru ghandu ragun. Kont ser tispjegalna xi haga please?

**Ix-Xhud :**

Il-professur Cocinov kien konsulent mal-gvern Malti u kien qed jaghti pariri lill-gvern Malti. Il-laqghat li kien hemm bejn il-parti Maltija u n-naha tal-Kummissjoni Ewropea.., dan mhux dahal kulhadd u balbuljata fuq xuxlin! Kull ma dahlu xi tnejn jew tlieta min-nies li kienu li niftakar zgur lill-Ministru Bonnici u l-AG. Jigifieri meta ultimately kien hemm id-diskussjoni per se gol-kamra jitkellmu bejniethom insomma, kienu rapprezentanti Maltin. In-nies l-ohra u nkluz kien ma konniex god-diskussjoni. Ahna konna qeghdin barra.

**Imhalled A Lofaro :**

Ghal li jista' jkun, ok.

**Imhalled J Said Pullicino :**

Dottor Azzopardi, ghall-Inkjesta .. ..

**Dr Jason Azzopardi :**

Yes ok. Issa, ghax issemmiet fl-Inkjesta; din it-tieni domanda u l-ahhar domanda; issmmiet diga`. Biex inti li taf il-kuntratt tal-koncessonarju jekkdin tista' tispjegaha. Il-kuntratt li giet iffirmit mal-koncessonarju fl-2013 naqblu li jghid u jistipola li l-koncessonarju jista' ghandu dritt jobbliga jitlob Ministru biex jippartercipa f' promozzji ta' l-IIP barra minn Malta. Dina issemmiet fil-public accounts committee, mhux qed nikxef sigrieti.

**Ix-Xhud :**

Le le, din fil-fatt qieghda fil-public..; minhiex cert jekk hijiex Ministru jew senior government official.

**Dr Jason Azzopardi :**

Tajjeb hafna; tant l-ahjar, qed naqblu. Jigifieri ha naghmilhiekk iktar semplicement. .

**Ix-Xhud :**

Jigifieri mhux qieghda esklussiva imma..

**Dr Jason Azzopardi :**

Ghandek ragun Sur Cardona. Jigifieri qed naqblu li ma ssemmix il-Prim Ministru imma a senior government official.

***Ix-Xhud :***

Qed jistaqsi klawnsola f' kuntratt illi rajt ...; pero` l-concept jidhirli qieghd senior .. jew xi haga hekk.

***Imhalled A Lofaro :***

Ok.

***Dr Jason Azzopardi :***

Grazzi.

***Chairman Imhalled M Mallia :***

Grazzi.

Din hija s-sustanza tax-xhieda ta' **Jonathan Cardona** kif giet dettata minnu stess fil-prezenza ta' l-istess xhud.

Niddikjara li traskrivejt bl-ahjar hila tieghi x-xhieda ta' l-istess xhud.

Saviour Scicluna  
Traskrittur