

L-Atti tal-Inkjesta datata 19 ta' Novembru 2019, rigward skont it-Termini ta' Referenza ta' l-Inkjesta Pubblika dwar l-Assassinju ta' Daphne Caruana Galizia.

Seduta miżmuma illum it-Tnejn 17 ta' Frar 2020, fis-2:30 p.m. fit-Tieni Sular, Awla 20, il-Qorti.

Xhud **Corinne Vella** bil-lingwa Ingliza u bil-gurament taghha tghid :

Chairman Judge M Mallia :

Yes ghidilna.

The Witness :

What I have here 2 documents prepared, unfortunately acatully at short notice. There are 2 documents prepared at short notice to support the inquire. They concerned 2 witnesses who have been called to testify today. What I've done is collect information to the best of my ability to the best of my knowledge in the timeframe allowed to me. I don't claim that they are comprehensive collections if data relevant to that case. But all the information has been collected firsthand from open sources. Nothing is hearsay. Everything is documented, and if there is any gaps in the information I would be glad to provide the particular ..

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

But can you indicate what the information is and the content; can you just give us a description ..

Judge A Lofaro :

Who the witnesses are?

The Witness :

Yes; the witness have been called today are Josef Caruana and Neville Gafa`, both of whom were engaged in the Prime Minister's office. The information concerns their own personal public communications relating to Daphne, and Daphne's supports as they call ... more to say government critics. And they concern information just published well before Daphne's murder and afterwards. And what I have tried to do is organize information so that it can be understood as it is presented. But I do appreciate that there is a wider context which might in fair a wider meaning, and I'll be glad to take your

questions in that regards; whether today a later stage. Now what we have here, would like me to go through the documents?

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Yes please.

The Witness :

Yes. Shall we start with Josef Caruana; so what have done is collect screenshots of public communications from the timelines on social media and have group them.

Judge A Lofaro :

From Josef's social media?

The Witness :

From Josef 's Caruana social media.

Judge A Lofaro :

Ok; such as facebook and Instagram, I don't know.

The Witness :

Facebook, I did not have the time to go through Instagram, I am sure ... have done it;

Judge A Lofaro :

So facebook ..

The Witness :

So its facebook and twitter. And those are 2 sites which are use quite strongly in Malta ..in the media; which so that they are particularly significant. And I looked at categories of information. I didn't research the entire timeline because I don't have the time to do that. So is looking for anything then might have been related Daphne and within particular timeframes.

Judge A Lofaro :

And did you find?

The Witness :

I did find quite a lot of informations, so what we have here in Josef Caruana's document is 4 pages of notes; the rest of the documents which total is some 50 pages is supporting screenshots.

Judge A Lofaro :

Screenshots.

The Witness :

So the category as a fact I could just briefly go through the heading as .. you can go to the details. And Josef Caruana wrote editorials calling for the elimination of journalists and he actually named them, and Daphne was one of them. He seems to have participate then on an online campaign about against Daphne Caruana Galizia involving blogpost which he sighted at ..you know in his twitterfeed and so on. He endorsed by publishing or liking or up thinking communications by colleagues in the Prim Minister's Office which also carried similar messages. He accused Daphne's family of complicity in her murder. He participated at very least participated in what's seemed to be orchestrated campaigns to create false news leads and news narratives distracting media attention from the real source of information of Daphne's murder, the real culprits behind it and the real motive behind it. And there were several posts I found which targeted people who were critical of government and who have in one way or another been associated with asking for justice for Daphne.

And they range across.., those people range from the Archbishop and MEP from Romania, Civil Society Group that grew eventually into occupy justice; and then they took their name from the .., set outside Castile and stayed there overnight intense. There were attempts to mark Daphne's last words which have come abide with for the situation described when she said the situation is desperate. There is a lot of materiel there; and it seems to tie in with, you know, an orchestrated campaign to dehumanize her to discredit her. And to continue doing that even after her death. The reference is to hate blogger; that she disappeared from journalism, in other words attempts to criticize her family, to deminstramentalize them in a way of discrediting her or anything she says. I' ll be glad to go through the entire document ..

Judge A Lofaro :

Did he have or does he have a blog? Does he have a blog?

The Witness :

I am not aware of any blog that Josef Caruana maintains, but there is a blog which is no longer online which was produced by Glenn Bedingfield who was in the Prime Minister's Office. I came across completely by a chance thanks to Josef Caruana himself an enormous blog called – 'Veru Biss' which was setup on the 9th of May 2017; shortly after Daphne had published her reports about Pilatus Bank and her reports about the Prime Minister's wife's association with a company in Panama. And shortly after Daphne was killed, Josef

Caruana retweeted one of those blogposts, and that particular blogpost compared Daphne unfavorably to Michelle Muscat. I tried to search around that particular tweet, which was in late October, here is, the 28th of October 2017; that was 12 days after Daphne was killed.

I tried to find out for by searching around other social media why that blogpost was pulled out. I didn't find any explanation but perhaps Josef Caruana can explain himself. But I am not aware that he actually published that blogpost himself.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

And you also prepared a dossier in relation to another witness Neville Gafa`? Can you please explain what the content there is?

The Witness :

Yes, Neville Gafa` we found retroactively where he actually worked; he has had a string of jobs in government. Starting in June 2013 and ending up in the Prime Minister's Office where he resigned on 14th of January this year. While he was employed with government he used to social media to .. I don't know what can you say when you find a string of comments and post and

Judge A Lofaro :

This is facebook and twitter am I right?

The Witness :

Facebook and twitter largely because those the once I searched. And I didn't have time to look at other social media.

Judge A Lofaro :

And again, is there a blog in his name?

The Witness :

I didn't find any blogs in his name; but again I can say this is a limited search it's not a comprehensive one. What I can't vouch is what is in the document I can't speak for what has been left out. A more extensive search is not going to find this information incorrect; it's going to find that is more than I've actually found myself. And these both men are people in the Prime Minister's Office; both attacking a journalist who was very critical of government. And what I found in Neville Gafa's case is that there were things like he used what we call hashtags which is a way of aggregating, social media messages so people can share them and amplified them. He was using one called which was – 'Galizia barra'; and he and another person connected to the Prime Minister's Office Robert Musumeci were using this hashtag to provide.. and elections were going to be what rose Daphne out.

She wasn't running for election but it's almost .. believes their own propaganda that she was associated the politics and that she had a vest interest in a particular political party. That was one of the things I found. Other things I found where photographs of Daphne going about her normal life. ..Being up loaded stocking pictures in a fact. In one case she was in Valletta with her pet dog and with our niece who was a minor at that time, and these photographs were published by Neville Gafa` on his timeline on facebook in his own name. I have no way of knowing whether these photographs were also used in the secret facebook groups because I don't have access. So that might be something that needs to be explored.

One of this most was disturbing sets of photographs was .. they looked perfectly innocuous but they are disturbing because they were taken on the 15th of October. This was the day before Daphne was killed. This is when Neville Gafa` was also already implicated in the lists of ...which suggest he is connected to criminal networks. So you have to look at the photographs as I did; you look at those photographs something this is somebody who connected to criminal networks. Stalking a woman who was killed the next day. You start to wonder if there is a connection. These are photographs of her and her husband at garden festival in Floriana. But then there is a whole string of photographs of her having her feed done, her at supermarket, taking a walk near her house, and sitting at a Café, going you know being at the airport to bring her sons coming from abroad. And you know, sometimes the same photos are published more than once. So if you just look at them you think they repeat; but then you look again and you realize that the same photos were repeatedly published.

So you see what ...what he is trying to proof. But it's there. There is even a photograph which I found which was taken at San Anton School and published on San Anton Schools page, when they held, on their own initiative, held a commemorate ceremony for Daphne after she was killed; because her sons were at that school; so the students of that school wanted to plant a tree in her name. It was not our initiative. They invited us there as a family and was a wonderful thing to see young children, some are young at 8, making speeches; you know, thinking is really important enough for them to commemorate. And we were just there because we were guests. There was a photograph published on.. and he saw fit Neville Gafa` saw fit to republish it and saying ..we will trying to take over the school. In other words references it to Daphne as a hate blogger association of her with the previous leader of the opposition; a whole sting of posts connecting Daphne's writing to the current leader of the opposition, you know, and it was at that time when the Daphne project was published; so there was this campaign running which was called the Truth Project as a count narrative to the Daphne project and as a

whole string of post attacked the Truth Project that Neville Gafa` published in his own name. You know, trying to pin investigations on the opposition.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

You said there is a photo of her walking by her house? Did I understand that well?

Judge A Lofaro :

Yes that` s what I understood, taking a walk outside .

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

And can you tell us which ..

The Witness :

Taking a walk yes close to her walk; close to her house yes in Bidnija; to see the house ..

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Which photo?

The Witness :

It`s on page 9 the bottom one.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

So it`s the bottom one; ok. And on page 21 there are screenshots which says hashtag the situation is desperate but then there are inserts of like Josef Caruana, Dorianne Fenech, Frederick Attard, Joseph Gerada. Can you explain what those are therefore what we should understand by these...?

The Witness :

Ok, I will explain what I did there. .. in some cases I found the post and then I opened up the.. you know the view box which shows you who actually approved the post. By proving it you communicated to your network.

Judge A Lofaro :

By proving you said.

The Witness :

What you do is when you post something on facebook people can do what they call - like it. They .. like to show they approve it.

Judge A Lofaro :

Yes.

The Witness :

That depending on persons settings. That in that affect that you endorsed that post is communicating to your network. So just by .. if I have a thousand followers ..

Judge A Lofaro :

So even if it isn't shared; just a 'like' would be enough?

The Witness :

Sometimes, it depends on the person's settings; sometimes it is open. And what I did was when I opened up this post I found that the same post had been liked but several people linked to government. So it looks like it was part of a campaign. A deeper wider investigation probably reveals more of this kind of thing. But I did include this one because it shows that it wasn't just a random post. There was a purpose to it. And that would necessarily have been amplified further by the networks to whom those people are connected.

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Li ma nafx jekk ghandkomx ta' Neville Gafa` jew kellkomx ta' Josef Caruana wkoll.

Judge A Lofaro :

Jien ghandi. Le ta' Gafa' ma ghandix.

The Witness :

Jekk nista' nispjega l-printout li ghamilt illum ta' Josef Caruana l-kontenut huwa l-istess; li biddilna l-formating biss biex ikun ..

Dr Therese Comodini Cachia :

Ipprezentajtu; mhix problema.

The Witness :

Ok. Thank you.

Chairman Judge M Mallia :

Thank you.

Din hija s-sustanza tax-xhieda ta' **Corinne Vella** dettata minnha stess fil-prezenza ta' l-istess xhud.

Niddikjara li traskrivejt bl-ahjar hila tieghi x-xhieda ta' l-istess xhud.

Saviour Scicluna - Traskrittur.